

Report PW 2025-03 Attachment 3

Evaluation Matrix

Client: Oxford County
Project: William St SPS Class EA
Project Number: 52049-100



Criteria	Weighting
Natural Environment	15%
Social Environment	15%
Heritage/Cultural Impacts	15%
County Operations	15%
Technical Feasibility	20%
Cost	20%
TOTAL	100%

Evaluation Matrix									
Criteria	Description	Alternative 1a	Alternative 2	Alternative 3A	Alternative 3B	Alternative 4A	Alternative 4B	Alternative 5A	Alternative 5B
		Do Nothing	Upgrade existing SPS for full projected capacity.	Construct new SPS for future flows at the location adjacent to Public Works yard to operate in conjunction with the William St SPS.	Construct new SPS for full projected capacity at location adjacent to Public Works yard.	Construct new SPS for future flows at the location adjacent to WWTP lagoon to operate in conjunction with the William St SPS.	Construct new SPS for full projected capacity at location adjacent to WWTP lagoon.	Construct new SPS for future flows at the location adjacent to existing William St SPS property to operate in conjunction with the William St SPS.	Construct new SPS for full projected capacity at location adjacent to existing William St SPS property.
Natural Environment	o Effects on vegetation, water quality, wildlife and aquatic habitat, wetlands, terrestrial resources, woodlands, species at risk. o Indirect impacts of a SPS. o Impacts of spills or overflows.	0	0	3	2	7	7	5	4
Total		0	0	0.45	0.3	1.05	1.05	0.75	0.6
Social Environment	o Impacts on local community. o Anticipated impacts during construction. o Influence on community aesthetics.	0	0	3	5	5	8	2	3
Total		0	0	0.45	0.75	0.75	1.2	0.3	0.45
Heritage/Cultural Impacts	o Potential impacts on cultural heritage resources, including built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes, and archeological resources.	0	0	8	8	8	8	8	8
Total		0	0	1.2	1.2	1.2	1.2	1.2	1.2
County Operations	o Operation of the sewage pumping station (i.e., safety, maintenance, emergency response, etc.)	0	0	5	8	3	9	5	7
Total		0	0	0.75	1.2	0.45	1.35	0.75	1.05
Technical Feasibility	o Construction feasibility o Pump station operation (capacity constraints, operation).	0	0	2	8	2	6	3	6
Total		0	0	0.4	1.6	0.4	1.2	0.6	1.2
Cost	o Anticipated capital, operating, and maintenance costs.	0	0	3	5	3	6	3	5
Total		0	0	0.6	1	0.6	1.2	0.6	1
Total Scores		0	0	3.85	6.05	4.45	7.2	4.2	5.5
Rank					2		1		3

Legend		
Low Impact 7-10	Moderate Impact 4-6	High Impact 1-3
Low Impact 7-10	Moderate Impact 4-6	High Impact 1-3
Low Impact 7-10	Moderate Impact 4-6	High Impact 1-3
Good 7-10	Moderate Impact 4-6	Poor 1-3
High Feasibility 7-10	Moderately Feasible 4-6	Low Feasibility 1-3
Low Cost 7-10	Moderate Cost 4-6	High Cost 1-3